

Shutesbury Board of Selectmen Meeting Minutes Tuesday, June 10, 2014 at 7:30 AM at Town Hall

Members present: Chairwoman Elaine Puleo and member Al Springer.

Members Absent: April Stein.

Remote participation: None.

Staff present: Town Administrator Rebecca Torres, Administrative Secretary Leslie Bracebridge.

Press present: None.

Guests: Highway Superintendent Timothy “Tim” Hunting and Warner Brothers paving personnel Alan Chicoine, Warner Brothers Division Manager, and Paving Superintendent Kevin Cislak.

Chairman Puleo opened the meeting at 7:35 A.M. at the Shutesbury Town Hall upper level conference room.

Appointments

The Board of Selectmen met with Shutesbury Highway Superintendent Timothy “Tim” Hunting, Warner Bros., LLC All States Materials Group Division Manager Alan Chicoine and Paving Superintendent Kevin Cislak to talk about the condition of the pavement on Leverett, Cooleyville and Prescott Roads (LCP) put down by Warner Brothers in late summer 2008, and the potential for future paving contracts for the Town of Shutesbury and Warner Bros., LLC:

- Tim presented photos of potholes and broken pavement along the LCP, his concern for present and future issues with that pavement, and his concern for his FY 15 paving projects by Warner Bros. if Shutesbury signs the Franklin Regional Cooperative Highway Products and Services Bids and Contracts authorization statement for FY 2015, as Warner Brothers won the Cooperative’s low bid.
- Tim reviewed the “ripples” on Pelham Hill Road following Warner Brothers’ paving job last year.
- Alan responded to Tim’s concerns: Warner Brothers has paved successfully for Shutesbury for quite a few years. The ripples on Pelham Hill Road were caused by a faulty CAT brand “screte plate.” The ripple is felt mainly when riding in a truck, not a car. The ripple will not affect the integrity of the road.
- Alan understands Warner Brothers is the low bidder for the Regional Cooperative contract and Warner Brothers wants to work for Shutesbury. Alan describes other work done in Shutesbury as “decent.”
- The LCP was paved under MassHighway specifications. The mix that they use is a different mix from what towns use, and it wears differently. The state mix has a larger aggregate and is more open. Five years in, the pavement is starting to come apart.
- Kevin and Alan went into detail about the history of pavement formulas from before world War II right through the recent differences between the old “450” specs and the new “460” specs.
- The 460 was first piloted in Massachusetts in 2009. It dictates the way the pavement is put down. It is tested for wheel rutting, tensile strength, and stripping. The 460 specs made a stronger pavement causing the term “super pavement.”
- Paving contractors are held to limits. They get graded on their volumetrics. They get penalties if they do not stay within formula limits. Warner Brothers had no penalties on LCP. They met specs exactly.
- Discussion of last winter’s broken pavement on Rte. 202 and the 1-inch overlay being put down now.
- Tim understands that “reflective cracking” will come back in 2-4 years. He repeats his disappointment in LCP, and asks if it was all reclaimed. (Reclaimed is to chew up the old pavement, it stays in the road bed, calcium chloride is added and it is then packed down with the vibratory roller. Then a top coat of paving is added.) Tim was reassured that the LCP was totally reclaimed.
- Kevin: It doesn’t appear that the sub-base is failing. Alan: You’re going to get heaving; the problem is more the mix on top.
- Elaine: What do we do to stop or reverse it?

- Tim: patching, possibly crack-filling. In the winter the water runs into the cracks, freezes, expands and further cracks the blacktop. Kevin: As soon as you have one crack it opens the door for another.
- Alan: This road is an open mix. Even Rte. 202 is a tighter mix. The water gets in and it just starts “popping” it. It starts little, then, every time a car hits it, it breaks out another piece. I don’t think there’s a problem with the binder. You can see MassHighway uses a different mix. The stuff we do for the towns is much tighter. They (MassHighway) stood beside us right down to how much to roll it. They tell you you’ve rolled it enough or you haven’t. They tell you if it’s not dense enough.
- Kevin: Within the next few years the towns will be forced to use a Mass DOT approved mix which will be implemented into Chapter 90. The 450 specs made a far less good product than what we have now.
- Elaine: What’s the difference between super pave and what you would do for our towns?
- Kevin: Pavement is determined by the level of use from 1 to 4, which in turn is based on the number of cars (axles) on the road. All of the town work is going to be level 1, low volume. Warner Brothers has done a lot of level 1 paving for towns. The mix in use right now will be put through a huge amount of testing prior to approval which has never happened before.
- Alan: How much sand, stone and liquid asphalt.
- Kevin: They’re going to tell us, we have to add or subtract asphalt. We’ll have to get compaction in the lab. They’ll test for rutting, and tensile strength, which determines longevity. You will get longevity out of the change because of the criteria. Correct application and depth all goes into it. Without the correct application it can all go down. Everybody has to go back for recertification.
- Alan: There’s a lot more to this than just opening the factory. UMass has a lab. There’s a lot to it.
- Elaine: Are we being short-sighted in not having higher specs and more testing?
- Alan: Not yet. Look at your roads now. You’ve had good luck. West Pelham: Alan and Tim agree the reflective cracking on West Pelham is typical cracking.
- Alan: Figure an inch per year. These roads in New England are “engineered cow paths.” Unless you dig a road out like a super highway, you can’t stop cracking. It’s not worth it to spend all kinds of money on testing right now.
- Alan and Kevin sum-up by asking the Selectmen and Tim to judge them on the work that they have done for the town. We’ve worked for you for many years. You’ve got a competitive bid (through the Franklin Regional Cooperative Highway Products and Services Bids and Contracts). “It stings if we don’t get the work.” You’re not going to stop cracking.
- Becky: We’re upset by a road with state specs, and state specs changed shortly after our road was done.
- Kevin: Gives an example of a super-pave pilot project: Rte. 5 and 10 through Whately south of the truck stop. It’s doing pretty well, it was not reclamation. It went through several mix designs.
- Tim: Warner Brothers did Weatherwood Rd. That was reclaimed, it has stood up, but it doesn’t get the wear. You get heavy use and trucks on LCP. Tim expresses his surprise that all of LCP was reclaimed.
- Alan: The damage on LCP is more top down than coming up through.
- Elaine: What fix can we do? Is there a less expensive, timely repair?
- Tim: It will be worse next spring. Crack-filling addresses cracks. It’s cheaper than over-laying. Tim wonders about joint separation if he was to mill out and re-pave a couple of bad sections.
- Elaine: Wonders if there is value to doing something like what they are doing right now to Rte. 202.
- Tim: That’s what we’ll have to do when we do it. The worst part of the road is from here (Town Hall) to Leverett. Becky asks the cost of mimicking the Rte. 202 fix, and rough calculations are attempted.
- Alan you would get a Band-aid: pothole patch for a few years and then overlay. Wait until it gets bad and mill.
- Tim: We have structures now. 96 structures some we can mill by; 28 basins overall.
- Alan you don’t get 20 years out of a road. The liquid asphalts have been modified. Venezuela used to fine off the crudes.

- Kevin: The whole process has changed dramatically.
- Tim: Reviews changes in the spraying formulas over time.
- Alan: They're making more environmentally friendly products.
- Kevin: That's the industry.
- Alan that's what catapulted Mass highways' implementation of super pavement. The old mixes of years ago were much better.
- To Becky's question, an estimate of \$200,000 is suggested to repave the LCP with 1 inch as is being done on Rte. 202.
 - That doesn't include costs of raising the structures, which is always outside of the paving costs.
 - Alan and Kevin would really recommend an inch and one half, not an inch: That's \$300,000, and they would have to "tack." The state now requires "tacking."
- The western section of Leverett Road that the town did, at the same time that the LCP section was being done by the state, did not get "tacked."
- Alan: You don't have to do the whole thing; do it in pieces, or wait till it gets a little worse and mill it.
- Tim: There's just 3 of us; we'd be out all summer raising structures. We're a maintenance operation.
- Alan: We hire subs to raise structures. They're cheaper. For you guys to tie up days.
- Becky: The stretch of Pelham Hill Road where the screen wasn't working properly looks a lot worse with rain on it.
- Alan: It won't go anywhere, it just has a shine: A screte is a big piece of steel that pushes down on the pavement. When it heated up it warped. When it cooled off we couldn't tell. When it got hot, it had a bend to it. You can't get under it when it is hot. CAT came back to us and gave us another one. It's not going to affect the longevity of that section of Pelham Hill Road.
- Alan we want the town's (future) work. For town work, you have not had a problem with longevity.
- Tim: Stowell Road, done in 2007 by Warner Bros. is perfect
- Tim: You're always going to see cracking. Lane did "super-pave" from 134 to 444 Wendell Road. That cracked in the usual time.
- Becky: Feels the state is at fault on LCP and that Warner Bros.' normal pavement would have held up. The state set the specifications and held Warner Bros. to them.
- Kevin: regardless even if you mill it, if there's a crack in the milling, it's still going to come through.
- Alan: Everybody knows it. They'll do coring they check the densities in the lab; you're not going to stop it. Interstates crack; everything in New England cracks.
- Becky wonders: "Will you have enough flexibility with new specs?"
- Kevin: We'll have enough flexibility to get the right pavement for the towns. You'll see a cost increase to the towns but you'll see a better product. Still, an inch and one half overlay is an inch and one half overlay; you're still going to get what's underneath. The worst thing you can do is to seal blacktop. It's meant to expand to a certain degree. New England is not forgiving.
- Al Springer: Once you get the cost increase, you'll have to see if you get more years from a road to make the pavement cost decrease.
- Becky: We won't have a choice.
- Alan: It's a science now. He invites the members of the Board to "Come down to the lab: We have a super-pave lab" with gyratory equipment, hundreds of thousands of dollars worth of equipment.
- Kevin: Before we even set foot on a job the lab work is unbelievable. I can also see this from the perspective of the Town of Shutesbury. I'd have called this meeting as well. We probably wouldn't be having this conversation if we had used a town mix. The new Rte. 202 pavement is a tighter mix. The transfer machine is in the 460 specs. It takes the mix and remixes it right before it goes down, so you don't have segregation. There's a ride piece. A computer judges smoothness; it's a \$400,000 machine. We didn't have one for LCP. You need a wide open road to use it. (Tim confirms: It's a big machine.)

We have \$1,500,000 in equipment on the road, not counting the paver. You have to today. It's not a little investment.

- Tim: Has talked with a Lane employee also. He said it's the mix just like you say. He wondered, if they could be putting too much RAP (Recycled Asphalt Product) into the mix.
- Kevin: Actually LCP got less RAP than what 202 is getting right now. You can't take junky roads and put them back in: 15% of materials can go into the top and 35% into the binder. Back then it was 10%. They checked what we put in. It's all figured into your bid price. Asphalt is the most widely recycled material in the world. Mass Highway has guidelines that we have to follow. RAP has increased: It doesn't hurt the mix if it's done right.
- Amherst had trouble with a section of Sunderland Road originally done with "hot in place" mix by a group from Ohio. They heat up the existing pavement to soften it, then laid it right back down flat with a "rejuvenator." But heat ages pavement. After the first year it was horrible. Warner Bros. was called in for the repair: Warner Bros. took off 3 inches of pavement. The hot in place cost Amherst \$10/yard. Warner Bros. could have paved 2 to 3 inches at that price. Warner Bros. warned Amherst, but Amherst wanted to try it. It was the wrong application for that section of Sunderland Road.
- Elaine: What is the right fix that we can afford and that will give us 5 to 8 years?
- Kevin: Overlay a piece at a time just like Alan said. The right way would be to mill the top off.
- Tim: Just like they're doing on Rte. 202. You wouldn't have to do any structure stuff. Can you get 5 years from an overlay? Yes, if it's at least an inch and a quarter thick. If you wait: You're going to have to mill it. Next year it's going to be really bad. There will be twice as many potholes.
- Alan: You could bring in a small paver and do the potholes to make it last a little longer.
- Tim: Chapter 90 is committed to Lakeview Road this year. Tim saved some from last year's Chapter 90 to have enough to pave Lakeview Road. To pave LCP, we would have to bank Chapter 90.
- Alan: You just cut a joint and you piece it.
- Tim: When you just cut a slot, it will eventually crack. What makes it worse is because it's the main road, it gets all the traffic. The traffic volume has increased dramatically in the past 5 years.
- Al Springer: It was better when we had all the potholes.
- At 8:38 AM Kevin states that he has to leave to get to a funeral: "I had no problem coming up to talk today; he hopes this was helpful. I hope that we answered your questions. I certainly don't want this job (LCP) to reflect on us." He offers to assist in any way with estimates, measuring, and specifications. He comments about the difference in specifications in 5 years: "It's a mass flip, it's changed so much." Kevin thinks the flip may be a result of roads like this (LCP). There wasn't a contractor around which didn't have problems ten years ago; that mix used ¾ inch stone. Kevin leaves.
- Tim and Alan discuss the new center line joint method being used on Rte. 202.

Alan leaves at 8:45 AM.

Al: It looks like they did what they were supposed to do (on LCP).

Tim: I have no complaints with Warner Bros. except for Pelham Hill Road.

Al: We were told the LCP would be good for 20 years.

Tim: Even at the time, Tim felt 10 years was more realistic. Tim is comfortable awarding Warner Bros. the Lakeview Road bid. They know they will be watching. Tim states that he would feel differently if he had had trouble with anything else, but LCP, no. The only other trouble was Pelham Hill Road, and we have that on record. They're good guys.

Elaine: Is OK with Tim's decision.

Tim asks if anyone feels we shouldn't and no one responds.

Tim: Offers his suggestion on what to do with LCP: You can take a section where you can see it bad, and mill out a big long patch. He doesn't know at what cost. There are quite a few sections like that. We have \$20,000 in pothole money. Tim was considering getting a "hotbox" that sits in 1-ton and has a light burner:

140610 Select Board

It keeps the hot patch hot while patching here, pulling up and going to the next pothole. It would also keep cold patch hot in the winter time. It costs less than \$16,000. It would be handy to have. Tim will try to get a price on milling small patches. Big companies like Warner Brothers will be too busy to do it.

Becky: If the state does release the other million dollars, the other culvert should be done right away. It will eat up the rest of the Chapter 90 funds.

Tim has never milled. He's reclaimed (taken off an inch). Milling would take it right down. I don't know that we'd get out of these cracks. Tim thinks the base is good. Tim acknowledges that he would like to move forward with the culvert. "You wish someone would leave us a few million..."

Tim asks once again if the Board is Ok with Warner Bros. for now, and Becky speaks for everyone stating Warner Bros. has support across the board.

Tim: Wonders about reclaiming Lakeview from the bridge to the stop sign. We could use the pothole money for that. It has gone beyond the ability to be overlaid.

Tim leaves at 9:00 AM.

List of Documents and Other Exhibits Used at the Meeting: NONE

The Select Board **adjourned at 9:00 A.M.**

Respectfully submitted,

Leslie Bracebridge
Administrative Secretary