

Present

SLBC Members: Mary Anne Antonellis, Stephen Dallmus, Brad Foster, Dale Houle, Penny Jaques, Molly Moss, Elaine Puleo, Jeff Quackenbush

Guests: Becky Torres (Town Administrator), Neil Joyce (CMS), Roger Hoyt (CMS), Lauren Stara (MLBC) , Mike Vinskey, Weezie Houle

INTERVIEW FORMAT Each firm was allotted one hour, with a 15-minute transition time between firms. Design firms began with a 20-minute presentation, followed by 40 minutes of questions from a previously-determined list asked by Quackenbush, then additional questions from members of the Library Building Committee. Order of presentations was selected randomly.

INTERVIEWS

Oudens Ello 4:00 p.m.

Present: Matt Oudens, Conrad Ello, Dominick Wick (project manager)

Established in 2007, 8-person firm. Oudens Ello did design work for Shutesbury's previous library proposal.

PRESENTATION

Worked on 16 libraries, 10 in coordination with MBLC. 5 projects are LEED certified. Eastham Library is net zero.

Recent projects:

2018 Eastham Library – Transformed 2,000sf one room library to a 17,000 sf facility by moving the original building and creating a much bigger addition. The project had significant storm water management issues.

2014 W Tisbury Library – Major renovation and addition. Altered grade to allow more light into building.

Sustainability: Net zero – Design would include renewable energy produced on site, can construct to be PV-ready for post construction addition, battery storage, energy efficient heating and cooling. Described use of mass timber (big beams/engineered wood) which sequesters carbon rather than using steel.

The firm has worked closely with Conservation Commissions to create bioretention swales to channel water to rain garden then to wetland.

Discussion of Shutesbury Site - has good orientation for solar, likely will need raised septic due to high water table, needs fire protection and water storage as building is over 5000sf. Noted that Shutesbury's library is smaller than other libraries than they have done thus spaces need to do double-duty. They are familiar with our building program – outdoor space is critical.

HIGHLIGHTS OF INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

Anticipate no personal changes during project; small office with lots of principal involvement and collaboration.

The most successful projects grown from good relationship with client: monthly meetings held for West Tisbury Library, took time to structure community process.

Cost control: estimates at each milestone, the design stage is important, needs enough definition for good estimate

Visual presentations make a big difference in engaging public; best when everyone can visualize. Firm uses Revit.

Timeline: Fall 2023 to complete design is hard, early 2024 more realistic to allow for estimate.

Environmental challenges: Hitchcock Center had contaminated soil – too expensive to remediate. High water table – septic mound is now amphitheater.

Post Construction Follow-up: visit project after 6 months of occupancy to see what works. Stay in touch.

Why is timeline so aggressive: small library grant is fast-tracked. Stara: primary concern is to keep escalation down. Joyce: this is not a big building, wants aggressive design for fall 2023.

Torres: for construction to start in March 2024, bid needed by January 2024.

LLB 5:15 p.m.

Present: Jeffrey Porter (project manager), Mark Ritz (architect)

Drayon Fair (principal) absent due to COVID

8 principals, 25 staff, est. in 1935, based in Pawtucket, Rhode Island with office Worcester, MA.

PRESENTATION

Latest projects - Marlborough and Sharon Library (in construction); has worked with MBLC.

Sustainability: designed 6 LEED buildings; thinking about green projects is 2nd nature.

Bolton Library – the addition reflects historic original building.

Noted Shutesbury's town hall and church – would make library part of that landscape, match materials and scale with surrounding landscape; would include flexible community spaces

Emphasized stakeholder engagement. Design process would be very collaborative, especially early on for community buy-in. Goal is to deliver the best project for OUR town: collaborative process, make sure everything fits, good adjacencies. Noted that they provide 3 estimating points for budget cost control

Team strengths: Skilled team, collaborative, record of delivering on time and on budget, attention to detail,

HIGHLIGHTS OF INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

How does having 2 offices, one out of state, factor in? Staff are well connected.

Would work closely with OPM, available when needed. Fair and Ritz would be primary contacts throughout process.

Expects good communication between town and firm with frequent meetings.
Failures: Sharon Library required a big pivot during design as historic committee hated initial design.
Cost control: 3 estimates during design process.
Engaging public: will come when invited, good listeners
LEED accredited: LEED certification adds to cost; can still do green building with certification.
Timeline: OK with timeline, expect frequent meetings.
Uses Revit and energy modeling
Environmental challenges: asbestos in soil had to be removed at a site.
Post Construction Follow-up: several follow up meetings after construction is complete. 10-month report and 12-month warranty period.
Availability: "very available"
How would you handle problems with systems or materials? 149 projects required 3 alternatives.
Limited experience with small projects in small towns.

Johnson Roberts

6:30 p.m.

Present: Philip O'Brien (principal), Stewart Roberts (principal in charge)

13-person firm, based in Somerville, MA.

PRESENTATION

Firm specializes in libraries and knows small libraries. Have built many libraries in Western Mass: Hadley, Leverett, Sunderland, Erving, Greenfield (on schedule and under budget). Also Pelham library/safety complex. Libraries are 'living room of the town.'
Firm has completed 90 library feasibility studies, with 29 libraries completed, many MBLC libraries.

Try to make each library a reflection of its community. Leverett library is their smallest at ~100 sf smaller than Shutesbury's new library.

Community engagement during process-oriented design: design charrets, community forums, produce videos for websites

Cost estimating done by 3rd party for cost control results in 4% below estimate for average BID. change orders average under 1% due to careful documentation, noting 5% is more typical.

Commented that the Shutesbury New Library website is the "Most democratic website ever seen."

Discussion of Shutesbury's new library site: Firm was well familiar with the site. Recommended a paved drive, with permeable material for parking area. Connect hiking trails with library site. Library is "Room of Requirements."

Commented that the cost estimate done during building program was at \$1000 sf – this seems high, suggested \$600- \$700 sf range.

LEED certified buildings have been completed with additional funding. A “green building” can be built without the expense of LEED certification.

HIGHLIGHTS OF INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

Personnel: O’Brien and Roberts would stay involved throughout project. Natalie would have day-to-day oversight of design and documentation. Currently have 14 projects at various stages; only one other is in design phase (Deerfield).

Green construction: LEED certification costs ~\$100K. You can do the same green things without certification. While NET Zero building is expensive, it’s easier to do with a building our size.

Timeline: seems reasonable, expect 9-10 months for design.

Environmental challenges: build South Hadley library on former water treatment plant site.

Post Construction Follow-up: 1 year warranty. At 9-10 months a site visit would be scheduled (after a full heating/cooling season).

DISCUSSION OF INTERVIEWEES

LLB: Presenters were inarticulate. Stara noted that Drayton Fair, LLB’s principal, was not present.

Oudens Ello: Presentation focused on sustainability; they would design an environmentally-friendly building. They were thoughtful about our site; gave examples of environmental remediation used in other projects. Can they design a library that fits our town?

Johnson Roberts: While Oudens Ello came in with a lead in the ranking, Johnson Roberts gave a compelling presentation. Their preliminary design carefully located library out of wetlands. They have built many libraries; Moss is aware of problems in some of these libraries.

Puleo made a motion to rank Oudens Ello first and Johnson Roberts second. Quackenbush seconded.

Roll call vote: Antonellis-aye, Dallmus-aye, Foster-aye, Houle-aye, Jaques-aye, Moss-aye, Puleo-aye, Quackenbush-aye.

Next meeting: December 27th